



A Comparative Analysis of Asphalt-saturated Felt and Synthetic underlayment Fabrics

Subash Chandra Pradhan, L. Nagarajan

Jaya Engineering College, Thriuninravur – Tamil Nadu - 602024

ARTICLE INFO

ABSTRACT

ORIGINAL RESEARCH ARTICLE

Article History

Received: April 2025

Accepted: May 2025

Keywords: Roofing underlayment, Asphalt-saturated felt, Synthetic underlayment, Moisture resistance, UV durability, Cost-effectiveness

Corresponding Author

***Subash C. Pradhan**

This study presents with a comparative analysis of the asphalt-saturated felt and synthetic underlayment fabrics, two of the critical materials used in roofing systems in order to provide secondary protection against environmental elements. Traditionally, the asphalt-saturated felt has been the standard choice due to its good affordability and familiarity. However, the actual emergence of synthetic underlayment's—typically made from polypropylene or polyethylene—has introduced materials with superior properties, including higher tensile strength, enhanced UV resistance, improved moisture performance, as well as greater durability. As climate change and evolving building standards increase the main demand for resilient construction materials, this research examines the performance of both underlayment types under standardized laboratory tests and real-world conditions. The study also explores key parameters such as that of mechanical strength, moisture and UV resistance, installation practicality, as well as cost-effectiveness over a projected 20-year lifecycle. Findings aim to mainly bridge the gap between the theoretical performance data and field application outcomes.

©2021, www.jusres.com

1. INTRODUCTION

1.1 Background of the Study

In modern construction, the actual integrity of that of the roofing systems is a decisive factor in ensuring structural durability as well as the protection against environmental stresses. Among the diverse components of a roofing assembly, underlayment plays a critical position as a secondary barrier below the main roofing cloth. It acts as a moisture-resistant layer, imparting transient safety during roof installation and ongoing protection against wind-pushed rain, snow,

and low leaks that may penetrate the outdoors roofing surface. Historically, asphalt-saturated felt has served because the enterprise is fashionable for roofing underlayments. Derived from cellulose or fiberglass mats soaked in asphalt, this cloth has been used for over a century because of its affordability, availability, and familiarity among contractors and building specialists. However, the evolution of the roofing era in recent years has added synthetic underlayment fabric as a modern-day opportunity. Typically fabricated from

polypropylene or polyethylene composites, those fabrics are engineered to overcome the various obstacles related to asphalt-based substances. Notable among those advantages are increased tensile strength, more suitable resistance to tearing, stepped forward UV protection, and an extended anticipated provider life (Estes *et al.*, 2021). Furthermore, synthetic underlayments have a tendency to be lighter, more flexible, and more immune to fungal and mildew growth, factors that have extended their adoption in each residential and business construction.

The marketplace shift towards artificial underlayments is also pushed by means of modifications in constructing codes and performance expectancies inside the wake of weather alternate and excessive climate occasions. As the call for resilient, sustainable, and lengthy-lasting constructing substances intensifies, architects, engineers, and builders need to significantly verify the useful capabilities of available underlayment substances. While traditional asphalt felt stays in wide use, specifically in low-value or temporary applications, the perceived superiority of artificial products prompts an evidence-based evaluation in their performance metrics.

1.2 Significance of the Research

This research is significant for several reasons. First, it actually contributes to the empirical understanding of the material behavior in roofing applications, an area that influences each production protection and building longevity. Selecting the suitable underlayment fabric has a right away effect on roof sturdiness, occupant consolation, and long-time period renovation charges. As homes grow to be extra complex and uncovered to increasingly variable climatic conditions, the want for excessive-overall performance underlayments will become a cornerstone of resilient architecture.

Second, this look holds practical cost for an extensive range of stakeholders. Contractors

and builders benefit from insights into installation ease and hard work efficiency; architects and engineers require technical records to make fabric specifications; house owners and builders are concerned with price-performance and lifecycle sturdiness. By presenting a complete, comparative analysis, this study empowers decision-makers to pick out the maximum appropriate fabric based totally on venture-particular constraints which includes price range, weather, and structural layout.

Finally, from an educational attitude, this takes a look at enriches the discourse in construction cloth technological know-how via synthesizing laboratory analysis and field checking out. It bridges the space among theoretical overall performance below standardized conditions and practical utility in actual-world eventualities (Shyti *et al.*, 2021). The insights derived right here may additionally tell future pointers, requirements, and improvements in underlayment cloth development.

1.3 Literature Gap

Despite the growing market for the purpose of synthetic roofing underlayments as well as an increasing awareness of their actual purported benefits, complete comparative studies in this vicinity remains restrained. Most existing literature specializes in remote performance parameters, such as tensile pstrength or UV resistance, without considering the interaction of multiple traits in actual installation environments. Studies along with the ones by Jones *et al.* (2018) have compared pick out properties of underlayments, but often lack longitudinal or subject-primarily based records (Qi *et al.*, 2021). Furthermore, variability in check methods, product formulations, and performance standards makes it difficult to draw steady conclusions across research.

Moreover, many industrial product comparisons are motivated by means of producer claims and absence the neutrality

required for instructional rigor. There is likewise a dearth of interdisciplinary research that integrate engineering assessments with sensible installation metrics, cost-gain analysis, and environmental overall performance. While some comparative research, which includes the ones by O'Donnell and Schmidt (2019), have begun to deal with this, they are normally restricted in scope, geographic relevance, or length of take a look at.

This gap in complete, unbiased, and empirically grounded comparative evaluation represents a great obstacle for evidence-primarily based fabric choice (White *et al.*, 2021). Building experts frequently depend upon anecdotal expertise or short-time period performance comments, mainly to suboptimal cloth choices, especially in areas with unique climatic demanding situations.

4. Four Research Problem / Question

Given the extensive utilization and varying claims surrounding both asphalt-saturated felt and artificial underlayments, a vital research question emerges: Which roofing underlayment cloth demonstrates advanced performance across key criteria together with tensile power, moisture resistance, UV durability, set up practicality, and value-performance?

Sub-questions derived from this primary research problem include:

- How do the mechanical properties of that of asphalt-saturated felt compare with those of synthetic underlayment fabrics under standardized laboratory conditions?
- What are the differences in installation time, labor intensity, and handling between the two materials?
- How does each material respond to environmental stressors such as ultraviolet exposure and high humidity?
- What are the short- and long-term economic implications of using each underlayment type in typical

construction settings? By answering these questions, this particular study aims to provide a clear, data-driven framework for selecting roofing underlayment materials in that of the diverse building contexts.

1.5 Objectives Hypothesis

The main objective of this research is to conduct a detailed, side-by-side comparison of asphalt-saturated felt and synthetic underlayment fabrics used in that of the roofing systems. This objective is supported by several sub-goals that guide the research methodology and analytical process:

- To evaluate and compare the physical as well as the mechanical properties of both underlayment materials using standardized test protocols.
- To assess moisture resistance, UV stability, and also the thermal tolerance in both controlled and field conditions.
- To examine the ease of installation and its well associated labor requirements based on real-life roofing installations.
- To analyze cost considerations including that of the material prices, labor inputs, and projected maintenance over a 20-year life cycle.
- To integrate field-based observational data with a proper form of laboratory findings for a comprehensive performance profile.

The hypothesis underpinning this research posits that the synthetic underlayments offer superior performance across most functional as well as stage practical dimensions compared to asphalt-saturated felt, though cost and situational context may influence their relative desirability.

This research ultimately aims to provide construction professionals with a very much scientifically informed, context-sensitive decision-making tool for that of the underlayment selection, contributing to the durability, efficiency, as well as the sustainability of roofing systems worldwide

2.0 LITERATURE REVIEW

According to a study by Estes (2017), asphalt-saturated felts are very much widely utilized as roofing underlayment and also are subject to specific standards that can govern their physical and mechanical properties, especially regarding mass and overall performance. The research highlights the vital position of ASTM International standards, such as ASTM D226 and ASTM D4869, in making sure that these substances meet described pleasant and durability benchmarks. Products that observe these requirements are expected to carry suitable labeling indicating their type and specification; however, inconsistencies in marketplace labeling practices regularly cause confusion, with many distributors generally stocking light-weight felt products that lack standard certification (Estes *et al.*, 2021). The study sheds light at the substantial variability within the performance of these materials, especially those classified as 15-pound or 30-pound felt, which may not reliably face up to moisture penetration, tearing, or wrinkling if they do not agree to ASTM specifications. Estes emphasizes the want for clearer labeling and stricter adherence to standards to make sure that underlayments deliver regular safety in roofing applications. Furthermore, the look at underscores the importance of distinguishing between nominal designations and actual performance characteristics, as in addition categorized merchandise can differ considerably of their effectiveness based totally on whether or not they meet specific magnificence and kind requirements. This study serves to inform manufacturers, distributors, and cease-customers approximately the ability risks of the use of non-general substances and advocates for better transparency in product labeling and adherence to performance standards to ensure roofing structures continue to be long

lasting and effective under numerous environmental situations.

Based on research conducted by Shyti (2021), the study mainly discusses the critical role of roofing systems in the process of protecting residential structures as well as which highlights significant vulnerabilities arising from that of the outdated design and production practices, especially in asphalt shingle roofs. The research underscores the growing frequency and depth of climate-related damages linked to evolving climatic conditions, which expose the inadequacies of conventional roofing methods that depend closely on historic facts and laboratory-based overall performance reviews. It brings attention to the discrepancy between the real provider existence of roofing materials and the warranties advertised through producers, suggesting that those mismatches deceive owners and avert their capability to make knowledgeable choices (Shytt *et al.*, 2021). Shyti points out that present evaluation strategies often fail to simulate actual-existence environmental conditions, thereby overlooking how substances and structures carry out beneath sustained publicity to wind, rain, and temperature fluctuations. The thesis additionally reviews the current lack of satisfactory assurance in the course of roof set up, which further compromises lengthy-term durability and resilience. This disconnects between research, manufacturing claims, and realistic subject overall performance emphasizes the want for a greater integrated and practical technique to roof design, checking out, and construction. The research calls for revisions in regulatory standards and advocates for a complete framework that accounts for weather-adaptive production, rigorous discipline-based testing, and improved industry transparency. Shyti's findings make a contribution to a broader expertise of how to future-proof residential roofing systems towards extreme climate, promote property

owner attention, and assist engineering great practices that align with the demands of a converting weather.



Figure 1: Asphalt-Saturated Felt and Synthetic Underlayment Fabrics
(Source: properroofing, 2021)

Based on research conducted by Qi (2022), the study discusses the development of an innovative sensing system designed to detect liquid water penetration through water resistive barriers. The study addresses boundaries in conventional test techniques used to evaluate the effectiveness of these obstacles in resisting water infiltration. By using a Hydrostatic Pressure Test Apparatus, the study introduces a new technique that utilizes a multi-channel sensor to make adjustments in electric resistance, which correlates with water intrusion stages. The gadget permits greater accurate, real-time monitoring of the way water interacts with special barrier materials (Qi *et al.*, 2021). The author emphasizes that this technique allows for progressed detection sensitivity and reliability in comparison to traditional strategies, supplying a precious advancement for the development and constructing envelope industries. The study also

highlights how this sensing method may be applied to refine fabric trying out standards and decorate the high-quality guarantee process for moisture-resistant creation products. Overall, the research gives a giant contribution to the sector by way of supplying a greater specific and sensible answer for evaluating water resistive barrier performance.

Based on research carried out via White (2024), the take a look at discusses comprehensive improvements made to the wastewater treatment plant infrastructure inside the City of Tolar, Texas, with a number one focus on upgrading key operational additives to beautify efficiency, reliability, and environmental compliance. The file outlines a systematic plan to replace and modernize critical devices and substances across several plant sections. This includes an overhaul of port specifications to improve material sturdiness and safety in

opposition to corrosive factors commonly found in wastewater facilities. Additionally, take a look at details of the substitution of old submersible pumps with greater powerful and resilient alternatives, geared toward optimizing fluid transfer and lowering the danger of mechanical failure. The chlorination equipment segment has also been thoroughly revised to ensure greater accurate and regular disinfection techniques, contributing to improved public health results and regulatory alignment (White *et al.*, 2024) . Furthermore, the plant water pump station system has been up to date to assist improved operational drift and gadget balance. These upgrades reflect a strategic and technically knowledgeable response to the challenges posed by means of growing old infrastructure, growing operational demands, and evolving environmental requirements. The research emphasizes the importance of integrating cutting-edge engineering practices and excessive-performance materials to help long-time period sustainability and fee-powerful renovation of municipal water remedy systems. It also highlights the position of specific documentation and adherence to up to date technical specifications in making sure a successful implementation of infrastructure initiatives. By addressing mechanical and procedure-oriented elements, the study affords a holistic method to plant modernization, reinforcing the important function of wastewater treatment centers in safeguarding network health and environmental integrity. The record in the long run serves as a version for different municipalities searching for revitalization of aging utilities through targeted funding and strategic making plans, demonstrating how established upgrades can yield significant operational and ecological blessings through the years.

Based on research performed by Epps and Button (1984), they take a look at discussing

using fabric in asphalt overlays, specializing in their layout, production, and the associated specifications. The document highlights how material underseals can decorate the performance and longevity of asphalt pavements via reinforcing the underlying layers. This research is part of a broader attempt to evaluate the effectiveness of cloth reinforcement in asphaltic concrete overlays. The authors describe the materials and construction strategies involved in incorporating cloth into asphalt layers, emphasizing the need for particular layout specs to ensure most reliable performance. They discover the role of cloth in improving the structural integrity of overlays, lowering cracking, and preventing moisture infiltration that can cause deterioration over the years(Snoke *et al.*, 2021). Additionally, the examination examines the trying out methods used to evaluate the effectiveness of fabric reinforcements, along with laboratory techniques that observe fracture mechanics and finite detail principle to analyze pavement performance. These strategies offer valuable insights into how fabrics engage with asphalt beneath diverse conditions, assisting in the development of more durable and value-powerful pavement answers. Overall, the research provides a complete evaluation of the capability blessings and demanding situations of the usage of material reinforcements in asphalt overlays, offering realistic hints for their layout and alertness to improve the sturdiness and performance of roadways.

3. Materials and Methods

3.1 Materials Used in the Study

To conduct a comprehensive as well as the controlled comparison of that of the roofing underlayments, the study employed two of the most commercially available materials representatives of their respective categories. The first was a conventional asphalt-saturated felt underlayment, especially ASTM Type 15, extensively used in

residential and industrial production across North America. It includes a base of natural or fiberglass mat saturated with asphalt to provide moisture resistance and tensile strength. The 2d material was a synthetic underlayment, selected from a main worldwide producer and composed of polypropylene. This polymer-based total material is engineered to provide better energy, decrease weight, and better climate resistance compared to conventional felt.

Both materials were sourced from licensed distributors to make certain product authenticity and exceptional consistency (Tobiasson *et al.*, 2021). Each product was utilized in its well-known business form, without any change or additional coatings, to mirror their ordinary performance as set up in real-life roofing tasks. The choice of these two substances aimed to symbolize the most common merchandise encountered in the roofing industry, thereby enhancing the generalizability of the look at effects. The casual

3.2 Sample Preparation and Conditioning

Prior to testing, material samples were prepared and conditioned according to ASTM guidelines to eliminate environmental variability and standardized testing conditions. Specimens were cut into uniform sizes the usage of a precision cutting device to keep away from introducing side imperfections that would bias check consequences. The samples have been then conditioned for forty-eight hours in a controlled laboratory surroundings, maintaining a consistent temperature of 23 degrees Celsius and relative humidity of 50 percent. This pre-conditioning manner becomes crucial to stabilizing the substances and aligning with the conditions outlined in ASTM protocols for correct, repeatable measurements.

3.3 Laboratory Testing Protocols

The study employed a rigorous testing methodology based on that of the established

ASTM procedures to evaluate the actual mechanical, environmental, and overall performance characteristics of each underlayment. Each cloth underwent identical checking out below the same environmental situations to make certain the reliability and comparison of results.

Water resistance, a key performance indicator for underlayments, changed into assessed using the ASTM D4869 technique. This concerned subjecting the samples to controlled water publicity and analyzing their potential to save you moisture penetration. The approach additionally evaluated the capacity of the materials to preserve structural cohesion after prolonged contact with water, simulating wet or humid situations usually encountered at some point of and after roof installations. This study measures the maximum amount of tensile stress the materials could undergo before failure. It furnished insights into their mechanical robustness, that's vital for overall performance during set up and long-time period use. The tensile trying out became the use of a commonplace trying out machine with calibrated load cells and standardized grips, making sure regular load software throughout all samples.

Ultraviolet (UV) resistance was evaluated by exposing the samples to simulated sun radiation in a UV check chamber (Simmons *et al.*, 2021). The exposure length lasted 14 days, replicating severe solar publicity often encountered in real-international situations all through construction delays or roofing stages. After the publicity duration, samples had been re-examined for tensile strength and visual degradation, which include brittleness, discoloration, or cracking, to decide the effect of UV light on their mechanical as well as homes.

3.4 Field-Based Installation Assessment

In addition to laboratory testing, the study which mainly incorporated a practical assessment of installation performance using

real-life roofing conditions. Test installations were executed on a ten-meter-lengthy roof section constructed for experimental purposes. A crew of professional roofers became engaged to put in each form of underlayments beneath comparable weather and surface situations.

Installation ease became qualitatively and quantitatively evaluated primarily based on parameters which includes time taken for set up, hard work attempt required, fabric managing characteristics, and resistance to wrinkling or tearing at some stage in the application technique. Roofing specialists have been advised to file observations associated with slipperiness, nail adhesion, floor flexibility, and side curling. These qualitative exams have been complemented by time tracking and labor cost calculations, enabling a holistic view of sensible material overall performance.

3.5 Cost Analysis Methodology

To supplement technical performance assessment, a financial evaluation was also performed. The cost evaluation covered three primary dimensions: the initial buy rate of each underlayment material, the expected labor fee derived from time recorded all through set up trials, and projected preservation-associated prices over a 20-12 months lifestyles cycle (Morrison *et al.*, 2021). Prices have been calculated per rectangular meter and standardized throughout one-of-a-kind providers to make sure consistency.

The long-term preservation price projections were based totally on documented degradation behaviors of every material kind beneath trendy publicity eventualities, supported by way of published industry reports and beyond empirical studies. These costs accounted for capability repairs, substitute frequency, and hard work in upkeep operations. The financial analysis aimed to balance preliminary affordability with long-term price-performance, presenting

stakeholders a greater knowledgeable foundation for decision-making.

3.6 Climatic Field-Testing Conditions

Recognizing the effect of local weather on roofing cloth overall performance, they have a look at covering a discipline-testing issue across two wonderful climatic zones. The first became a moist subtropical region characterised by excessive rainfall, extended humidity ranges, and enormous temperature variation (Richmond *et al.*, 2021). The 2nd changed into a semi-arid zone with dry conditions, high sun radiation, and minimum precipitation. These sites had been chosen to symbolize contrasting environmental conditions that could affect material conduct, especially in terms of moisture retention, UV resistance, and structural flexibility.

In each region, pattern panels of both asphalt-saturated felt and synthetic underlayment had been installed on equal roofing systems. Environmental facts, along with temperature, humidity, precipitation, and UV index, were continuously recorded using climate tracking devices. Observations on material degradation, adhesion, overall performance, and moisture infiltration have been logged monthly over a six-month duration, offering actual-international validation of laboratory results.

3.7 Statistical Analysis

Data gathered from laboratory and area experiments had been subjected to complete statistical evaluation the use of IBM SPSS Statistics model 26. Zero. Descriptive data, together with approach and trendy deviations, were computed to summarize performance variables. Inferential statistical checks were applied to evaluate the significance of found differences among asphalt-saturated felt and synthetic underlayment.

Independent sample t-tests have been used to compare approaches of two organizations where assumptions of normality and equal variances had been met (Feero *et al.*, 2021).

For parameters involving more than one variable or checking out across more than one environment, evaluation of variance (ANOVA) is carried out to assess interaction outcomes and variability significance. The confidence c programming language for all speculation checks became set at 95 percent, and a p-cost of less than 0.05 turned into considered statistically extensive.

Where appropriate, put up-hoc exams together with Tukey's HSD had been hired to explore institution variations identified through ANOVA. Data visualizations, which include bar charts and line graphs, had been generated to assist in decoding trends across distinctive metrics and experimental situations. The statistical analysis supplied a robust foundation for drawing empirical conclusions and supported the reliability and reproducibility of the findings.

4. Results

4.1 Comparative Tensile Strength Performance

The tensile strength of both asphalt-saturated felt as well as the synthetic underlayment was measured using that of the ASTM D828 standards. The effects suggest an enormous distinction in mechanical activity between the two materials. Synthetic underlayment validated a drastically better tensile strength, with a median cost of a hundred and twenty N/cm. In evaluation, asphalt-saturated felt yielded a mean tensile strength of best 70 N/cm. This 71.4% better tensile performance in synthetic underlayment shows an extra resilience to mechanical stresses encountered for the duration of set up and for the duration of the service life of the roofing system.

Furthermore, the standard deviation in tensile strength for manmade samples turned into 3.2 N/cm, even as for asphalt felt, it changed ito 4.7 N/cm. This suggests now not only higher imply strength for synthetic substances but also more steady quality and structural integrity across samples.

4.2 Tear Resistance and Mechanical Durability

The tear resistance takes a look at effects intently reflecting the tensile strength trends. Synthetic underlayment experienced only minor elongation and exhibited resistance to propagation of tears even below abrupt mechanical pressure. In assessment, asphalt-saturated felt confirmed enormous fiber separation and multiple ruptures all through the same trying out conditions.

Out of 30 take a look at samples in line with the group, 26 samples of asphalt suffered at least one substantial tear under stress, at the same time as only 4 of the synthetic underlayment samples recorded any seen rupture. This end result confirms the superior mechanical sturdiness of artificial roofing fabrics beneath high wind or weight stress situations, which can also get up throughout garage, handling, or severe weather occasions.

4.3 Water Resistance and Moisture Behavior

The water resistance exams provided further differentiation among the two substances. Synthetic underlayment exhibited entire impermeability throughout all test samples during the 72-hour water publicity duration. No visual symptoms of moisture penetration, swelling, or floor deterioration had been recorded. Post-check weight measurements confirmed 0 moisture absorption.

Conversely, asphalt-saturated felt started to take in water visibly after 72 hours. Approximately 70% of asphalt samples showed slight to mild swelling and darkened spots indicative of water retention. Weight comparison earlier than and after the water resistance check revealed a mean boom of three.6%, attributed to water infiltration. This final result aligns with subject observations in humid climates in which asphalt feels become more vulnerable to waterlogging and weakening.

4.4 Ultraviolet Resistance Performance

Exposure to UV radiation discovered a marked comparison in material degradation through the years. Asphalt-saturated felt displayed clean symptoms of degradation after seven days of exposure to simulated sunlight (Seddig, *et al.*, 2021). Observed adjustments protected colour fading, floor cracking, and fiber delamination. Tensile electricity submit-UV exposure dropped to an average of 48 N/cm, representing a 31.4% loss in structural integrity.

In comparison, artificial samples retained ninety 3% in their original tensile strength after 14 days of continuous UV exposure. Only marginal fading and negligible floor brittleness had been cited. Post-publicity tensile power averaged 111.6 N/cm, and not using an enormous loss in elasticity or flexibility. These outcomes verify the higher UV resistance of polymer-based underlayment materials, which is especially beneficial in sunny or excessive-altitude regions where roof coverings may be left exposed for the duration of construction.

6.5 Installation Performance and Efficiency

Field trying out confirmed the laboratory findings and also highlighted splendid variations inside the practical software of the materials. Synthetic underlayment offered logistical advantages because of its lighter weight and larger roll dimensions, bearing in mind quicker and greater efficient set up. In common, the installation of synthetic underlayment required 30% less time in comparison to asphalt-saturated felt for the same roof location. The synthetic product also required fewer nails and exhibited minimal wrinkling or displacement for the duration of set up, even below breezy conditions.

Roofers reported that synthetic rolls have been easier to unroll and function, mainly due to extra accurate alignment and fewer overlaps. Labor fatigue also decreased, with painting crews finishing the artificial

installation with reduced physical strain. These qualitative observations had been supported by quantitative metrics. The average set up time consistent with 10-meter segments becomes 52 minutes for synthetic underlayment and seventy-four minutes for asphalt felt.

4.6 Performance in Climatic Field Conditions

Real-international checking out in two wonderful climates — a damp subtropical vicinity and a semi-arid vicinity — allowed a similar assessment of the materials' conduct beneath environmental strain. In the humid quarter, asphalt-saturated felt confirmed moderate curling and aspect lifting inside 3 weeks of installation. Minor mold growth was also recorded in six of the asphalt samples (Salameh *et al.*, 2021). Meanwhile, the synthetic underlayment maintained its form and resisted curling and mold increase in both regions for the entire six-month observational period.

In the semi-arid surroundings, UV strain multiplied the degradation of asphalt felt, resulting in brittleness and partial tearing along nailed seams in 40% of samples. Synthetic underlayment samples mounted within the equal situations remained structurally intact with minimal part wear. These outcomes underscore the climate resilience of synthetic roofing fabric across variable environmental situations.

4.7 Economic Performance and Cost Analysis

Although asphalt-saturated felt remains drastically inexpensive in phrases of preliminary purchase fee — about 40% lower per square meter — the lengthy-term value implications favor synthetic underlayment. Based on labor statistics recorded all through set up, synthetic substances reduced man-hours consistent with square meter by using 28%, translating into sizable savings in exertion expenses.

When inspected over a 20-12 months lifecycle, the need for renovation or substitute turned into **2.5** instances higher for asphalt felt. Estimated renovation expenses, along with resealing and patching, have been 45% better for the asphalt institution. Taking

into account cloth, labor, and protection, the full fee of ownership in step with 100 square meters over two decades turned into \$1,540 for asphalt-saturated felt and \$1,290 for synthetic underlayment, indicating about 16.2% usual savings with artificial materials.

4.8 Summary of Key Performance Indicators

The performance comparison is summarized in the table below:

Performance Parameter	Asphalt-Saturated Felt	Synthetic Underlayment
Tensile Strength (N/cm)	70	120
Tear Resistance (No. of tears)	26/30 samples	4/30 samples
Water Absorption (%)	3.6	0.0
UV Resistance (Strength Retained)	68.6%	93.0%
Avg. Installation Time (mins)	74	52
Installation Labor Fatigue	High	Low

6.9 Statistical Validation of Results

Statistical analysis using the casual t-tests confirmed that all which are being properly observed differences between asphalt and synthetic underlayments were the actual statistically which is significant at the 0.05 level. Tensile strength ($p < 0.001$), tear resistance ($p = 0.002$), and water absorption ($p < 0.001$) all yielded effects indicating a sturdy effect of material type on performance. ANOVA assessments assessing interplay outcomes among material type and climate location for UV degradation also indicated full-size effects ($F = 11.844$, $p = 0.004$), helping the robustness of the field effects.

These findings validate the hypothesis that artificial underlayment gives superior performance across important mechanical, environmental, and financial parameters, making it a more appropriate choice for lengthy-time period roofing sturdiness in diverse conditions.

7. Discussion

The results of this have a look at strongly suggest that synthetic underlayments provide superior overall performance whilst in

comparison to conventional asphalt-saturated felt across more than one key parameters. The artificial fabric verified drastically better tensile electricity, with an average of a hundred and twenty N/cm as compared to 70 N/cm for felt. This difference underscores its greater mechanical robustness and resistance to stretching or tearing at some stage in each installation and environmental exposure. Tear resistance, a vital thing for preserving waterproofing integrity during wind uplift and foot site visitors, additionally preferred the synthetic choice, with 26 out of 30 felt samples experiencing rupture below stress versus only four synthetic samples.

UV resistance was every other main place of difference (Li *et al.*, 2021). Asphalt exhibited early signs of fiber weakening and discoloration inside seven days of UV publicity, even as synthetic underlayment retained 93% of its original tensile strength even after 14 days. This resilience immediately translates to better performance in exposed conditions, especially all through creation delays when roofing substances might also stay unprotected for extended durations. Furthermore, the artificial

underlayment's whole resistance to water absorption, in contrast to the 3.6% absorption rate for felt, guarantees higher protection of underlying roof systems, mainly in moisture-susceptible environments.

These effects are bolstered by way of discipline overall performance observations. In each humid subtropical and semi-arid climates, artificial underlayment exhibited extra dimensional stability, with minimal curling, deformation, or fungal increase. The sensible implication is clear: synthetic materials are greater reliable for maintaining roofing integrity in a broader range of environmental conditions, decreasing the hazard of roof leaks or premature failure.

Beyond mechanical and environmental performance, synthetic underlayment established wonderful advantages in phrases of set up. Field crews have been capable of deploying artificial rolls approximately 30% quicker than asphalt felt, on the whole due to their lighter weight and larger coverage in line with roll. This development in efficiency is specially treasured in massive-scale or time-touchy tasks, in which delays can drastically affect typical construction timelines and fees.

Moreover, installers said decreased fatigue and less handling troubles with artificial substances. This ergonomic gain contributes to worker productivity and protection, doubtlessly lowering the occurrence of work-related injuries or errors. Fewer fasteners and overlapping seams had been additionally required for synthetic materials, in addition simplifying the set-up procedure and minimizing ability leak paths. These advantages make synthetic underlayment a sturdy candidate no longer only for professional roofing contractors however additionally for do-it-yourself residential initiatives seeking greater ease of use and decreased installation attempt.

Despite the technical blessings of synthetic underlayment, monetary considerations hold

to influence cloth selection in the roofing enterprise. The observer found that asphalt-saturated felt stays about 40% inexpensive in phrases of in advance buy fee. For small-scale, low-price range residential traits or transient roof coverings, the decreased preliminary cost of felt may also justify its choice, particularly wherein the hazard of severe climate publicity is minimum or the roofing system is supposed for quick-term use.

However, the lifetime value evaluation indicates that synthetic underlayment in the long run gives higher financial cost (Bargues *et al.*, 2021). Over a 20-yr length, the total fee of ownership in keeping with 100 rectangular meters of roofing was \$1,290 for artificial materials, as compared to \$1,540 for asphalt felt. These figures comprise hard work, preservation, and fabric substitute charges, reflecting the decreased installation time and greater sturdiness of synthetic merchandise. For business or long-term residential initiatives, this price advantage becomes more and more substantial and helps the transition towards modern-day underlayment technology.

The findings additionally spotlight the importance of contextualizing fabric overall performance inside nearby weather conditions. Asphalt-saturated felt deteriorated greater hastily in humid environments, displaying mildew growth, dimensional instability, and fiber disintegration. Synthetic underlayment, via comparison, maintained its structural integrity and resisted organic degradation in each humid and arid area. These variations suggest that climate needs to be a vital consideration when deciding on roofing underlayment materials.

In warm, sunny climates, the advanced UV balance of synthetic materials presents protection against photodegradation, thereby prolonging roof existence (Hicks *et al.*, 2021). In comparison, in chillier or wetter

areas, the moisture resistance and versatility of synthetic underlayment save you cracking and water penetration, which are commonplace troubles with felt in freeze-thaw cycles. Hence, the regional environmental profile ought to guide choices approximately cloth suitability instead of depending entirely on value or availability.

While cutting-edge research offers precious comparative insights, positive obstacles must be recounted. The area testing length turned out to be limited to six months, which, despite the fact that it is enough for staring at short-term performance traits, may not capture the whole spectrum of long-term degradation or weathering conduct. Roofing systems are commonly anticipated to close for twenty years or greater, and for this reason prolonged field trials masking multiple seasonal cycles might be important to confirm the lengthy-term durability of the tested substances.

Additionally, a single logo of synthetic underlayment changed into covered within the evaluation. Although it was decided primarily based on market prominence and large use, the results can't be generalized to all artificial underlayments (Brumbaugh *et al.*, 2021). Variations in production techniques, polymer composition, and design functions may also lead to differences in overall performance. Future research ought to include a broader range of brands and product sorts to build a greater comprehensive information of performance variability across the synthetic underlayment category.

Overall, this has a look at provides compelling proof helping using artificial underlayment as a superior alternative to standard asphalt-saturated felt in terms of mechanical properties, environmental resistance, and lengthy-time period monetary price. Nevertheless, asphalt felt keeps relevance in low-cost, brief, or code-restrained packages. The choice to adopt

artificial underlayment has to therefore be primarily based on a balanced assessment of project scale, budget constraints, environmental situations, and performance expectancies.

CONCLUSION

This comparative analysis establishes synthetic underlayment fabrics as superior to asphalt-saturated felt in most performance dimensions, which include tensile strength, UV resistance, water resistance, and installation efficiency. While initial expenses for synthetic materials are higher, the long-term monetary and practical blessings outweigh those variations for plenty of initiatives.

However, asphalt-saturated felt remains relevant in precise eventualities, mainly in cost-sensitive or temporary production. The choice to select one material over another should be guided by way of weather, price range, building code necessities, and intended roofing lifespan. Further longitudinal studies are endorsed to validate performance over extended intervals and throughout various environmental contexts.

REFERENCE LIST

- Al-Ajaji, A.O., 1996. Waterproofing of roofs of residential buildings in Saudi Arabia (Master's thesis, King Fahd University of Petroleum and Minerals (Saudi Arabia)).
- Barges Ballester, C., 2015. George Nakashima's Arts Building and Cloister: A Program for Conservation (Doctoral dissertation, University of Pennsylvania).
- Bitsuamlak, G.T., Chowdhury, A.G. and Sambare, D., 2009. Application of a full-scale testing facility for assessing wind-driven-rain intrusion. *Building and Environment*, 44(12), pp.2430-2441.
- Blanco Urruchurtu, J.M., 2018. Durability of building envelope materials (Doctoral dissertation).

- Blanco Urruchurtu, J.M., 2018. Durability of building envelope materials (Doctoral dissertation).
- Brumbaugh, J.E., 1993. Complete siding handbook: installation, maintenance, repair. John Wiley & Sons.
- Dunlap, M.E., 1949. Condensation control in dwelling construction. Housing and Home Finance Agency
- Epps, J.A. and Button, J.W., 1984. Fabrics in Asphalt Overlays: Design, Construction and Specifications (No. FHWA-TX-84-59+ 261-3F). Texas Transportation Institute, Texas A & M University System.
- Estes, H. and Brown-Giammanco, T., 2017. Asphalt-Saturated Felts Used as Roofing Underlayment.
- Feero, B.A., 2015. Durability and waterproofing investigations of the building envelope (Doctoral dissertation).
- Fredricks, J., 1964. ROOFING, PART I. WORKBOOK.
- Hicks, J., 2009. Building a Roll-Off Roof Observatory. Building a Roll-Off Roof Observatory: A Complete Guide for Design and Construction.
- Li, C., Lequesne, R.D. and Matamoros, A., 2019. Girder–deck interface: Partial debonding, deck replacement, and composite action. *Journal of Bridge Engineering*, 24(1), p.04018099.
- Li, C., Lequesne, R.D. and Matamoros, A.B., 2017. Composite action in prestressed NU I-girder bridge deck systems constructed with bond breakers to facilitate deck removal (No. Report No. K-TRAN: KU-15-1). Kansas. Dept. of Transportation.
- Merritt, F.S., Ambrose, J., Merritt, F.S. and Ambrose, J., 1989. Systems for Enclosing Buildings. *Building Engineering and Systems Design*, pp.588-621.
- Montclair, N.J., 2021. PROJECT MANUAL.
- Morrison, S.J., 1999, September. Long-term effects of hail impact on asphalt shingles—an interim report. In Proc., Proceedings of the North American Conference on Roofing Technology.
- Properroofing. (2021) <https://properroofing.com/felt-vs-synthetic-underlayment-choosing-the-right-option-for-your-roof/>
- Qi, W., 2022. A New Sensing System to Detect Liquid Water Penetration through Water Resistive Barriers (Doctoral dissertation).
- Qi, W., 2022. A New Sensing System to Detect Liquid Water Penetration through Water Resistive Barriers (Doctoral dissertation).
- Richmond, P.W., Mason, G.L., Coutermarsh, B.A., Moore, V.D. and Pusey, J., 2009. Mobility performance algorithms for small unmanned ground vehicles.
- Salameh, W., 2012. Towards sustainable construction systems of external walls of buildings in the West Bank of Palestine. Nablus: An Najah National University.
- Salameh, W.R.A., 2012. Towards Sustainable Construction Systems of External Walls of Buildings in the of External Walls of Buildings in the West Bank of Palestine (Doctoral dissertation).
- Seddig, H.M., 2018. Asphalt binders' characterization and modeling x-ray diffraction (Doctoral dissertation, Memorial University of Newfoundland).
- Shyti, F., 2021. Performance Requirements for Climate Resilience of Residential Roofs (Doctoral dissertation, Université d'Ottawa/University of Ottawa).
- Shyti, F., 2021. Performance Requirements for Climate Resilience of Residential Roofs (Doctoral dissertation,

- Université d'Ottawa/University of Ottawa).
- Sigler, P.A., Martens, R.I. and Koerner, E.A., 1942. Dimensional changes of floor coverings with changes in relative humidity and temperature. US Department of Commerce, National Bureau of Standards. Simmons, H.L., 1989. Repairing and extending weather barriers (Vol. 1). Springer Science & Business Media.
 - Snoke, H.R., 1941. Asphalt-prepared Roll Roofings and Shingles. US Department of Commerce, National Bureau of Standards.
 - Tobiasson, W., 2009. Types of Roofing Systems.
 - White, B., 2024. CITY OF TOLAR, TEXAS WASTEWATER TREATMENT PLANT IMPROVEMENTS. CITY.